Summary of Appendix Q which compares the proposed scheme and ‘no channel’ alternatives

Riki Therivel

All of the information below comes from the revised Appendix Q of the environmental statement. The appendix considered two alternatives to the proposed channel scheme:

- A1. All components of the scheme (channel, raised defences, culverts etc.) but no channel at Hinksey Meadow
- A2. All components of the scheme but no channel at all.

This analysis covers Alternative A2. The main point is that the channel protects 50-160 homes, depending on the flood scenario, at a cost of £24 million (£150,000 - £450,000 per home). This is in addition to huge environmental, transport and recreational impacts. The communities most affected by the scheme – South and North Hinksey – would gain no benefit from it.

Table 5 shows that the channel (proposed channel scheme minus A2) will cost £24 million, and that the proposed channel scheme has a lower benefit:cost ratio (BCR) than A2.

Table 5: High level Economic Review.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scenario</th>
<th>Option</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2a</th>
<th>2b</th>
<th>A2</th>
<th>A1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Do Nothing (Baseline)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1,288.40</td>
<td>1,303.9</td>
<td>1,501.2</td>
<td>1,528.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Do Minimum no Temp Defences</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No Channel North Hinksey Meadow to Old Abingdon Road</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>65.7</td>
<td>66.3</td>
<td>12.4</td>
<td>10.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Proposed Channel Scheme</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1,268.7</td>
<td>1,284.2</td>
<td>1,380.5</td>
<td>1,386.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The proposed scheme would reduce flood risk at a total of 1050 properties. Of this, Table 6 shows that, for a 1-in-50-year flood (2% return period), the channel would protect 51 homes more than A2 (156 – 105). This is a £470,000 cost per home (£24 million / 51 homes). For a 1-in-100 year flood (1% return period), it would protect 157 homes more than A2 (524 – 367), at a cost of £150,000 per home (£24 million / 157 homes).

1 To be able to use the hyperlink, you first need to sign into the planning website: https://myeplanning.oxfordshire.gov.uk/Planning/Display/MW.0027/22#undefined. Scroll to the bottom of the page and click ‘accept’.

2 These are listed at Sec. 2 of App. Q.
This map below shows the extent of flooding that would occur with and without the channel under a 1-in-50-year flood. The raised defences, shown as yellow dots, protect the great majority of homes from flooding\(^3\). The properties that would be flooded under a ‘no channel’ scenario are mostly off the Botley Road and on Osney Mead.

---

\(^3\) Appendix Q states that the scheme will protect 1050 homes from a 1-in-100 year flood, but not how many homes it would protect from a 1-in-50 year flood.
This map below shows the extent of flooding that would occur with and without the channel under a 1-in-100-year flood. The additional 106 properties are much more scattered.